



Schmidt, D. (2014). Some don't like it hot. *Geology*, 42(9), 831-832.
<https://doi.org/10.1130/focus092014.1>

Peer reviewed version

Link to published version (if available):
[10.1130/focus092014.1](https://doi.org/10.1130/focus092014.1)

[Link to publication record in Explore Bristol Research](#)
PDF-document

University of Bristol - Explore Bristol Research

General rights

This document is made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the reference above. Full terms of use are available:
<http://www.bristol.ac.uk/red/research-policy/pure/user-guides/ebr-terms/>

Some don't like it hot

Daniela Schmidt

University of Bristol, Wills Memorial Building, Queens Road, Bristol BS8 1RJ, UK

The oceans are experiencing vast environmental changes that are predicted to accelerate in the future (Stocker et al., 2013). Warming, acidification, deoxygenation, and increased stratification act on a global scale, while other factors such as eutrophication, the effect of runoff changes of the carbonate system, and pollution act more locally. It is very hard to predict if these drivers will act synergistically, antagonistically, or additively on marine organisms (Pörtner et al., 2014). While individual drivers can be tested in laboratory experiments (see Pörtner et al. [2014] for a recent assessment), most of these experiments are too short with little acclimation or adaptation. Species interact (Munday et al., 2009; Sanford et al., 2014) and evolve (Collins and Bell, 2004; Lohbeck et al., 2012), which is proving to be highly challenging to test in laboratory settings or mesocosms.

The geological record provides an archive of the integrated effects of climate change and ocean acidification on marine ecosystems (Hönisch et al., 2012). The Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum (PETM), ca. 56 Ma, is a key interval for such comparisons as the effects of the climate perturbation can be found all over the globe and in all ecosystems (see McInerney and Wing [2011] and Sluijs et al. [2007] for a review). A substantial negative carbon isotope excursion suggests the addition of between 2000–6000 Gt of carbon to the atmosphere (Cui et al., 2011; Dickens, 2003). The global surface ocean warmed on average by 4–5 °C and the subsurface ocean by 5–6 °C (Dunkley Jones et al., 2013). A global shoaling of the carbonate compensation depth (Zachos et al.,

2005), combined with recent modeling (Ridgwell and Schmidt, 2010) and boron isotope analysis (Penman et al., 2014) propose ocean acidification in both the surface and the deep ocean. Ecosystem changes have been widely documented (Foster et al., 2013; Gibbs et al., 2006; Scheibner et al., 2005; Thomas, 2007; Webb et al., 2009) showing amongst others migration toward higher latitudes, changes in ecosystem composition, extinction amongst deep sea species, and calcification responses.

The usefulness of the geological record in improving our understanding of impacts of future climate changes and ocean acidification, though, depends on accurate regional climate reconstructions which allow a differentiated assessment of the impact on marine biota. Two papers in this issue of *Geology*, by Aze et al. (2014, p. 739) and Frieling et al. (2014, p. 767), increase our knowledge in two critical areas: the Indian Ocean (19°S) and the subpolar West Siberian Seaway (WSS, ~55°N) with the first PETM temperature reconstructions for these regions. Their novel tropical peak PETM values, which depending on calibration and if average or maximum values are considered, range from 32 °C to 43 °C with a warming of 3 °C above background. Similarly, warming is documented by Frieling et al. by ~7 °C to 27 °C in the WSS combined with seasonal anoxia.

Both of these papers contain provocative novel ideas. For example, a complete lack of temperature differences between the Arctic and the West Siberian Seaway provides new targets for climate models. These papers also point to the challenges working in comparative shallower water near coastal sections. Shallow water sites are often subjected to reworking and unconformities, both of which make identifying

46 baselines of pre-event climate variability and hence the relative amplitude of the warming
47 very difficult.

48 More importantly, though, both records point at our limitations to calculating
49 absolute temperatures for deep- time records. Using oxygen isotopes as in Aze et al.
50 meets the limits of our knowledge as seawater $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is not well constrained, resulting in a
51 several-degree uncertainty in temperature reconstructions (Tindall et al., 2010) as large as
52 the climate signal in the event. This is especially true in settings with strong evaporation
53 near the coast and likely a high variability in the carbonate system, by analogy to modern
54 shelf seas (Artioli et al., 2014). Additional effects such as unknown calibration equations
55 for extinct species and the effect of the surface-water acidification on isotope
56 incorporation just add to the problem (Spero et al., 1997). Given the very recent
57 quantification of the surface-water pH values prior to the PETM and the change within
58 (Penman et al., 2014), the most likely average sea-surface temperature for the PETM in
59 Tanzania was between 33.9 °C and 35.9 °C, which agrees well with temperature ranges
60 in model simulations (Huber and Caballero, 2011; Tindall et al., 2010) for pre-PETM
61 background values combined with the 3 °C warming found by Aze et al.

62 So if we take these data on face value, what are the consequences for biology and
63 what does this tell us about the future? These papers highlight the migration of
64 phytoplankton to follow their niche and suggest that the extreme warmth led to an
65 absence of calcifiers. Intriguingly, though, this abiotic zone appears several tens of
66 thousands of years after the onset of the extreme temperatures and the acidification and is
67 associated with changes in lithology and follows on from a gap in the record. This
68 potentially slow response contradicts everything we know about the ecosystem response

to decadal temperature variability for example the North Atlantic Oscillation (Beaugrand et al., 2009; Beaugrand et al., 2002) or in the California upwelling system (Chavez et al., 2003; Chavez et al., 1999). Aze et al. explain the abiotic zone by comparing to the temperature adaptation of modern foraminifers. One would expect, though, that Paleogene foraminifers who have evolved in a 15 °C warmer environment than today (Huber and Caballero, 2011) were generally adapted to these warmer temperatures. As so often, new papers ask more questions than they answer, such as why are these abiotic zones not found at other open ocean sites nearer the equator? If the high-end temperatures are reasonable estimates, these might point to physiological limits at which enzymes start denaturalising. Given the high metabolic rates in response to these hot temperatures, the supply of food supply to sustain the organisms is a pressing question and might have played a role in a regional exclusion. More work is needed, though, to move from assessments of past climates to predictive models for policy makers of the impact of future climate change on marine ecosystems such as the cascading effects of these potential abiotic zones in the food webs.

REFERENCES CITED

- Artioli, Y., Blackford, J.C., Nondal, G., Bellerby, R.G.J., Wakelin, S.L., Holt, J.T., Butenschön, M., and Allen, J.I., 2014, Heterogeneity of impacts of high CO₂ on the North Western European shelf: Biogeosciences, v. 11, p. 601–612, doi:10.5194/bg-11-601-2014.
- Aze, T., Pearson, P.N., Dickson, A.J., Badger, M.P.S., Bown, P.R., Pancost, R.D., Gibbs, S.J., Huber, B.T., Leng, M.J., Coe, A.L., Cohen, A.S., and Foster, G.L., 2014,

- 91 Extreme warming of tropical waters during the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal
92 Maximum: *Geology*, v. 42, p. 739–742, doi:10.1130/G35637.1.
- 93 Beaugrand, G., Luczak, C., and Edwards, M., 2009, Rapid biogeographical plankton
94 shifts in the North Atlantic Ocean: *Global Change Biology*, v. 15, p. 1790–1803,
95 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.01848.x.
- 96 Beaugrand, G., Reid, P.C., Ibanez, F., Lindley, J.A., and Edwards, M., 2002,
97 Reorganization of North Atlantic marine copepod biodiversity and climate: *Science*,
98 v. 296, p. 1692–1694, doi:10.1126/science.1071329.
- 99 Chavez, F.P., Ryan, J., Lluch-Cota, S.E., and Niquen, C.M., 2003, From anchovies to
100 sardines and back: Multidecadal change in the Pacific Ocean: *Science*, v. 299,
101 p. 217–221, doi:10.1126/science.1075880.
- 102 Chavez, F.P., Strutton, P.G., Friederich, G.E., and Feely, R.A., 1999, Biological and
103 chemical response of the equatorial Pacific Ocean to the 1997/98 El Niño: *Science*,
104 v. 286, p. 2126–2131, doi:10.1126/science.286.5447.2126.
- 105 Collins, S., and Bell, G., 2004, Phenotypic consequences of 1,000 generations of
106 selection at elevated CO₂ in a green alga: *Nature*, v. 431, p. 566–569,
107 doi:10.1038/nature02945.
- 108 Cui, Y., Kump, L.R., Ridgwell, A.J., Charles, A.J., Junium, C.K., Diefendorf, A.F.,
109 Freeman, K.H., Urban, N.M., and Harding, I.C., 2011, Slow release of fossil carbon
110 during the Palaeocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum: *Nature Geoscience*, v. 4, p. 481–
111 485, doi:10.1038/ngeo1179.

- 112 Dickens, G.R., 2003, Rethinking the global carbon cycle with a large, dynamic and
113 microbially mediated gas hydrate capacitor: *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*,
114 v. 213, p. 169–183, doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(03)00325-X.
- 115 Dunkley Jones, T., Lunt, D.J., Schmidt, D.N., Ridgwell, A., Sluijs, A., Valdes, P.J., and
116 Maslin, M., 2013, Climate model and proxy data constraints on ocean warming
117 across the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum: *Earth-Science Reviews*, v. 125,
118 p. 123–145, doi:10.1016/j.earscirev.2013.07.004.
- 119 Foster, L.C., Schmidt, D.N., Thomas, E., Arndt, S., and Ridgwell, A., 2013, Surviving
120 rapid climate change in the deep sea during the Paleogene hyperthermals:
121 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*,
122 v. 110, p. 9273–9276, doi:10.1073/pnas.1300579110.
- 123 Frieling, J., Iakovleva, A.I., Reichart, G.J., Aleksandrova, G.N., Gnibidenko, Z.N.,
124 Schouten, S., and Sluijs, A., 2014, Paleocene–Eocene warming and biotic response
125 in the epicontinental West Siberian Sea: *Geology*, v. 42, p. 767–770,
126 doi:10.1130/G35724.1.
- 127 Gibbs, S.J., Bown, P.R., Sessa, J.A., Bralower, T.J., and Wilson, P.A., 2006,
128 Nannoplankton extinction and origination across the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal
129 Maximum: *Science*, v. 314, p. 1770–1773, doi:10.1126/science.1133902.
- 130 Hönisch, B., et al., 2012, The geological record of ocean acidification: *Science*, v. 335,
131 p. 1058–1063, doi:10.1126/science.1208277.
- 132 Huber, M., and Caballero, R., 2011, The early Eocene equable climate problem revisited:
133 *Climate of the Past*, v. 7, p. 603–633, doi:10.5194/cp-7-603-2011.

- 134 Lohbeck, K.T., Riebesell, U., and Reusch, T.B.H., 2012, Adaptive evolution of a key
135 phytoplankton species to ocean acidification: *Nature Geoscience*, v. 5, p. 346–351,
136 doi:10.1038/ngeo1441.
- 137 McInerney, F.A., and Wing, S.L., 2011, The Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum: A
138 perturbation of carbon cycle, climate, and biosphere with implications for the future:
139 *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, v. 39, p. 489–516,
140 doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-040610-133431.
- 141 Munday, P.L., Dixon, D.L., Donelson, J.M., Jones, G.P., Pratchett, M.S., Devitsina,
142 G.V., and Døving, K.B., 2009, Ocean acidification impairs olfactory discrimination
143 and homing ability of a marine fish: *Proceedings of the National Academy of*
144 *Sciences of the United States of America*, v. 106, p. 1848–1852,
145 doi:10.1073/pnas.0809996106.
- 146 Penman, D.E., Hönisch, B., Zeebe, R.E., Thomas, E., and Zachos, J.C., 2014, Rapid and
147 sustained surface ocean acidification during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal
148 Maximum: *Paleoceanography*, v. 29, doi:10.1002/2014PA002621.
- 149 Pörtner, H.O., Karl, D., Boyd, P.W., Cheung, W.W.L., Lluich-Cota, S.E., Nojiri, Y.,
150 Schmidt, D.N., and Zavialov, P., 2014, Ocean Systems, *in* Field, C. B., and Barros,
151 V., eds., *Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability, Volume II: Contribution of Working*
152 *Group II to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate*
153 *Change*: Cambridge, UK, Cambridge University Press.
- 154 Ridgwell, A., and Schmidt, D.N., 2010, Past constraints on the vulnerability of marine
155 calcifiers to massive carbon dioxide release: *Nature Geoscience*, v. 3, p. 196–200,
156 doi:10.1038/ngeo755.

- 157 Sanford, E., Gaylord, B., Hettinger, A., Lenz, E.A., Meyer, K., and Hill, T.M., 2014,
158 Ocean acidification increases the vulnerability of native oysters to predation by
159 invasive snails: *Proceedings of the Royal Society B*, v. 281, no. 1778,
160 doi:10.1098/rspb.2013.2681.
- 161 Scheibner, C., Speijer, R.P., and Marzouk, A.M., 2005, Turnover of larger foraminifera
162 during the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum and paleoclimatic control on the
163 evolution of platform ecosystems: *Geology*, v. 33, p. 493–496,
164 doi:10.1130/G21237.1.
- 165 Sluijs, A., Bowen, G.J., Brinkhuis, H., Lourens, L.J., and Thomas, E., 2007, The
166 Palaeocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum super greenhouse: Biotic and geochemical
167 signatures, age models and mechanisms of global change, *in* Williams, M., et al.,
168 Deep Time Perspectives on Climate Change—Marrying the Signal from Computer
169 Models and Biological Proxies: The Micropalaeontological Society, Special
170 Publications, The Geological Society of London, p. 323–351.
- 171 Spero, H.J., Bijma, J., Lea, D.W., and Bemis, B.E., 1997, Effect of seawater carbonate
172 concentration on foraminiferal carbon and oxygen isotopes: *Nature*, v. 390, p. 497–
173 500, doi:10.1038/37333.
- 174 Stocker, T.F., Qin, D., Plattner, G.-K., Tignor, M., Allen, S.K., Boschung, J., Nauels, A.,
175 Xia, Y., Bex, V., and Midgley, P.M., 2013, *Climate Change 2013: The Physical
176 Science Basis: Working Group I Contribution to the Fifth Assessment Report of the
177 IPCC*: Cambridge, UK, Cambridge University Press, 1535 p.
- 178 Thomas, E., 2007, Cenozoic mass extinctions in the deep sea: What perturbs the largest
179 habitat on earth? *in* Monechi, S., et al., eds., *Large Ecosystem Perturbations: Causes*

180 and Consequences: Boulder, Colorado, Geological Society of America Special Paper
181 424, p. 1–23.

182 Tindall, J., Flecker, R., Valdes, P., Schmidt, D.N., Markwick, P., and Harris, J., 2010,
183 Modeling the oxygen isotope distribution of ancient seawater using a coupled ocean-
184 atmosphere GCM: Implications for reconstructing early Eocene climate: Earth and
185 Planetary Science Letters, v. 292, p. 265–273, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2009.12.049.

186 Webb, A.E., Leighton, L.R., Schellenberg, S.A., Landau, E.A., and Thomas, E., 2009,
187 Impact of the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum on deep-ocean microbenthic
188 community structure: Using rank-abundance curves to quantify paleoecological
189 response: Geology, v. 37, p. 783–786, doi:10.1130/G30074A.1.

190 Zachos, J.C., et al., 2005, Rapid acidification of the ocean during the Paleocene-Eocene
191 Thermal Maximum: Science, v. 308, p. 1611–1615, doi:10.1126/science.1109004.